In order to address some of the challenges faced in implementation of Indian government's flagship program Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin), the Madhya Pradesh state government introduced the direct benefit transfer of incentives to beneficiary households in 2016. This system uses an android application and web portal for digitizing the processes, resulting in direct transfer of toilet construction incentives into beneficiaries' bank accounts. The paper is based on a study which brings out the experiences of the direct benefit transfer model, based on field research in 3 districts of Madhya Pradesh. Findings indicate that the system has resulted in improved monitoring, efficiency and transparency; as well as reduction in scope for corruption. However a few bottlenecks were observed including process gaps, community access, capacity building, equity and ethical considerations. The paper also brings out the key enablers for effective implementation of the model in large-scale government programs.
The Direct Benefit Transfer Model in Madhya Pradesh SBM-G

The Madhya Pradesh state government has provided every household with a unique ID called the Samagra ID. The households' details such as name, address, mobile number and bank account details are linked to its Samagra ID. Usually, this process of mapping household details with Samagra ID is done by the Gram Panchayat (GP) functionaries.

The MP government has designed a system wherein a household can check its eligibility status by entering its Samagra ID, using a mobile-based android application (Swachh MP app) or a web portal (Swachh MP portal). Eligible households, upon completing the construction, can apply for the incentive using the same mobile app or portal. For verification of these applications, a supervisor, usually a panchayat or block level government functionary is appointed for every GP, and is given a unique login ID. The supervisor takes a geo-tagged photo of complete toilets, meeting the quality standards and uploads it in the Swachh MP mobile app. The block coordinator prepares an e-payment order for each eligible application, which is then forwarded to the bank for initiating the incentive transfer. There is a single bank account at the state government level, from which the incentive is transferred to the bank account mapped to the household's Samagra ID.

The Swachh MP portal and mobile app have a provision wherein the application status can be tracked at each stage by staff as well as the household itself, by entering the household Samagra ID. One can check the date and time when each step was completed, along with the name of government official involved at each stage.

The incentive can be transferred in one full instalment of INR 12000, or in two equal instalments of INR 6000 each, upon completion of substructure and superstructure respectively.

Research methodology

The research studied the experience of the direct benefit transfer model and online monitoring system in Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) in the state of Madhya Pradesh, and analyzed its initial successes and challenges.

The study involved a mix of qualitative and quantitative research methods. It involved fieldwork in three districts of Madhya Pradesh- Ashoknagar, Tikamgarh and Alirajpur. The district selection was done in consultation with the state government, trying to ensure diversity in terms of geographical and demographic conditions and DBT coverage.

The study involved i) review of state-level policy documents; ii) key informant interviews of the state, district, block and panchayat level officials, as well as some community members; and iii) a household survey of community members having a toilet, including households which had and had not availed the incentive. For the household survey, two blocks were selected in each district, and 4 gram panchayats were selected in each of these blocks. 24 households were selected in each of these gram panchayats, thus making the survey sample size across three districts 576 (192 households per district). To reduce bias, blocks and panchayats were selected in a way that captured variations in terms of distance from district headquarter.

Key findings

Successes

Greater efficiency in incentive delivery

The previous system of incentive transfer involved a number of intermediaries at GP, block and district levels. All the activities such as application, verification, approval and payment involved paperwork. Thus the entire process from application to payment usually took 1-3 months. The direct benefit transfer system has reduced this time significantly. As reported by the household survey respondents, the average time between the verification of toilets and withdrawal of money from bank account is 14.2 days. Streamlining of the incentive transfer process has not only reduced the workload on government officials, but also reduced the financial burden on households which invest in toilet construction, often with the help of loans.

Improved monitoring and accountability

The provision of uploading geo-tagged photos of constructed toilets in the mobile app has helped in strengthening the online monitoring system, by reducing the scope for false reporting and duplication. The quality of constructed toilets can be checked at the block level through the geo-tagged photos uploaded in the web portal, before the payment is approved. Names of government officials involved in each activity are
also reflected in the portal, along with the date of activity completion. Supervisors are required to complete verification of toilets within 7 days of application, and action may be taken by the administration in case of unwarranted delays. This monitoring system makes it possible to identify delays, mis-reporting and duplication; and take corrective action accordingly. Robust monitoring and improved accountability is a major achievement for a government sanitation program of this scale.

**Improved transparency**
The Swachh MP portal and mobile app make it possible for the beneficiaries to check their eligibility as well as their application status online. If required, a beneficiary can lodge a complaint by calling the CM helpline\(^2\). This is a step towards making the program more transparent and citizen-centric.

**Reduced scope for corruption**
Corruption in the form of bribes and misappropriation is a challenge which limits the impact of many government schemes, and leads to mis-utilization of public funds. DBT system has reduced the number of intermediaries between the government and beneficiaries of the program. The incentive is directly transferred into bank accounts of the beneficiaries, thus minimizing the scope for corruption by government officials.

**Challenges**

**Process gaps**
Gaps in process checks were observed in critical activities; such as entering bank details of households, and verification of constructed toilets. At times the makers and checkers\(^3\) of these tasks were same, thereby providing scope for manipulation and conflict of interest. Also, while the system records the date, time, person involved in the verification process, there is lack of clarity on how he/she would be held accountable in case of manipulation/delays.

**Community awareness, capacities and ownership**
Only 7% of the household survey respondents owned an android phone, which means that 93% of the respondents could not access the Swachh MP mobile app directly. For all respondents, the application was completed by the gram panchayat functionaries on the households' behalf. None of the respondents were aware which medium was used for their application, while only 0.35% respondents were aware of the provision of tracking incentive online. This dependence of households on gram panchayat functionaries provides potential scope for corruption by the latter.

It was also observed that for 24% of households, the toilet construction was led by the GP functionaries, and the beneficiaries were asked to hand over the incentive amount to the gram panchayat. Possible reasons this could be the pressure on gram panchayat to achieve targets in time, as well as the lack of willingness on the part of some community members. The reason for the latter could be behavioural, and/or lack of adequate capital. In some cases, the entire incentive money was taken by the GP without informing the beneficiaries about the inputs and construction costs, which is in contradiction to the program's philosophy of creating ownership among community and building accountability of the officials. Also, there have been concerns about toilets constructed by the GP being incomplete or of poor quality.

**Equity and ethical considerations**
It was reported that the provision of transferring incentives in instalments is not being encouraged by the district administration. A possible reason for this is that a few households, after receiving the first instalment, did not complete the toilet construction. This has affected the households which can't afford to construct the toilet in one go. Also, some elderly and PWD respondents reported difficulties in withdrawing incentive amount from their bank accounts.

The head of household is asked to stand in front of the toilet while taking the geo-tagged photo. All these photographs along with beneficiary details like name, address, phone number, Samagra ID, and location etc can be accessed from the web portal. Here the program may need to think about ensuring privacy of beneficiaries and security of their personal information.
Learnings
The introduction of direct benefit transfer model in Swachh Bharat Mission in Madhya Pradesh has helped the state government in strengthening processes and addressing a number of program bottlenecks. Other states may derive a few learnings from this experience and roll out similar models in order to enhance program quality and impact. Some key enablers of direct benefit transfer in large-scale government programs, involving the use of information and communication technologies (ICTs) for its implementation, have been identified and explained below.

Bank account coverage and unique identification system
Before the rollout of direct benefit transfer model, Madhya Pradesh government had in place the key enablers for the success of this model; namely a unique identification system for beneficiaries, a near to universal bank account coverage, and most importantly, a linkage between the two. As a result, the processes of beneficiary enrolment and incentive disbursal were implemented smoothly (although there were few cases where elderly and PWD respondents reported difficulty in withdrawing money from their account). This is in stark comparison to other programs in India where direct benefit transfer has been introduced, where lack of these enablers is a huge hurdle in its implementation.

Community awareness and capacity building
In order to make such programs more community-oriented, the adoption of appropriate ICTs needs to be supplemented with efforts to promote reach of the technology among community members, and build their capacities to access and use it. This will help in achieving the policy objectives of greater accountability, transparency, community ownership and citizen engagement.

Robust processes
While the introduction of ICT can improve governance by minimizing the margin for human error, the human element cannot be completely eliminated. Designing robust processes such as capacity building of implementers and community, monitoring, grievance redressal, accountability mechanisms etc. could play a significant role here. Inputs, outputs, stakeholders (makers, checkers), stakeholder responsibilities, accountability measures, timelines, remedial measures for all activities need to be clearly defined. In order to improve reliability, separate makers and checkers may need to be designated for critical activities. Also, enhancing data protection and privacy is an area which may require greater thought and efforts.

Acknowledgements
The authors would like to extend thanks to WaterAid India officials Mr. Binu Arickal, Regional Manager-West and Mr. Amar Prakash, State Program Coordinator-Madhya Pradesh for their help in coordinating with stakeholders. We would also like to thank officials of Swachh Bharat Mission- Madhya Pradesh for their support during the research study; and members of the CLTS Knowledge Hub at Institute of Development Studies, University of Sussex for their inputs in shaping up the paper.

References
AFRIDI F. 2017 Governance and public service delivery in India. Indian Statistical Institute
CHOWDHARY A. M. 2017 Direct Benefit Transfer Programme: The Case of Dilli Annashree Yojana. OneWorld Foundation India
IDS et al. 2017 Swachh Bharat Mission (Gramin) Immersive Research. Institute of Development Studies, Praxis and WaterAid
WADHAWAN D.A. 2017 Money siphoned off under Swachh Bharat Mission Scheme due to possible collusion at ground level. [online] [February 10, 2018]. Available from:
Notes
1. In India, the local governance system in rural areas comprises of three levels- district (highest), block and village (lowest). Gram Panchayat is the local village self-governance unit, elected by the citizens of the village. The panchayat is chaired by the elected leader of the village, known as a Sarpanch. The Secretary of the panchayat is a non-elected representative, appointed by the state government, to oversee panchayat activities. Gram Rozgar Sahayak (GRS) is the panchayat level functionary involved in execution of various government schemes, including SBM.
2. CM helpline, an initiative of the MP state government, is a toll free number by means of which a citizen can connect to the government directly and share grievances and complaints.
3. According to the maker and checker principle, at least two individuals must be required to complete a particular activity- one responsible for executing it and other for its verification and confirmation.

Contact details
Kanika Singh is a development consultant with interests in livelihoods, sanitation and public policy. Raman V. R. is the Head of Policy at WaterAid India, with expertise in systems and policies in health, sanitation and education sectors. Dr. Andrés Hueso is the Senior Policy Analyst-Sanitation at WaterAid with interests in sanitation, research and policy.

Kanika Singh
501A, IRCON CGHS, Dwarka, New Delhi, India
Tel: 9818733457
Email: 26kanika@gmail.com

Raman VR
WaterAid India, 2nd Floor, DLTA complex, Africa Avenue, New Delhi, India
Tel: 01166124400
Email: VRRaman@wateraid.org