Introduction

Communities triggered effectively with CLTS embark on a journey of rapid collective behaviour change. Achieving ODF status and getting certified as such are important milestones in the process rather than the end of the journey. Depending on a community’s exposure to private sector-provided sanitation and hygiene products, economic ability and access to markets for sanitation supplies and services, people take action to confine human excreta in basic, self-constructed or improvised facilities or aspire directly to obtaining more durable, higher quality latrine options. The poorest usually fall into the former category. They often have to re-build their basic, unimproved facilities repeatedly as they do not last through prolonged usage, rains or flooding, which means the risk of their lapsing back into open defecation remains high.

Bringing improved sanitation within the reach of the poor requires markets to expand options at the lower end. Sanitation service providers tend to have no interest in doing this as they lack resources for market research and product development and believe that the poor will not be profitable customers. Government agencies do not do this either, as they lack expertise in market development. There is thus a lack of affordable sanitation improvement options for poor consumers in rural markets of most countries striving to reach the sanitation MDG targets. This can be a significant constraint to scaling up rural sanitation sustainably, despite the demand and momentum for change catalyzed by CLTS.

In this context, the participants in the July 2011 CLTS Lukenya workshop examined learning gained thus far globally about how CLTS could be complemented with sanitation marketing in scaling up rural sanitation improvements with more sustainable behavioural impact.

Challenges

Understanding of sanitation marketing

- A clear and common understanding of what Sanitation Marketing means is needed – it is not just a supply issue
- Sanitation marketing is not just the supply of slabs – demand creation, market supply and marketing are all needed to reinforce each other
- Markets are context specific, depending on local conditions, communications, purchasing power etc. Hardware in one setting may not be fitting in another
- Sanitation marketing in a typical ‘WASH’ programme context requires the input of marketing and business development skills – these are currently not usually available in govt/NGOs
- Sanitation marketing is a separate issue to CLTS, with different actors but linked. It cannot be assumed that facilitators will market
Pro-poor market development for sanitation

- There is a need for improved understanding among stakeholders about pro-poor market development. This must be based on strong evidence from country-specific formative research and supply capacity assessment.
- Extending options for the poor - expanding existing markets for the otherwise unserved.
- Financing: pro-poor financing arrangements may be needed (loans, instalments, capital credit, etc) both for consumers as well as sanitation service providers and producers.
- Providing information/a range of models and cost options and facilitating availability without being prescriptive or selling one pre-determined product.

Key considerations for Scaling up Sustainably

- Artisans/masons are available in all communities – need to be found and supported.
- For going to scale, support may need to be provided at various levels of the supply chain from masons to entrepreneurs/vendors to aggregate supply and demand at regional/national level.
- There is no one best model – if the development of the market in general is facilitated, models will emerge.
- Formative research and supply chain assessment – needs to be supported (= public subsidy).
- Product options & business models for scaling up need to follow the research.
- Sanitation for the rural poor is a huge untapped market which could be very profitable. Sector policies, strategies and institutional practices create enabling environments for pro-poor market development when they do not hamper the free growth of consumer demand and market supply e.g. by providing subsidized products.

Experiences and ideas

1. Uganda: Sequencing of CLTS and Sanitation Marketing

Once villages are ODF, link masons and core promotional teams to start marketing, and selling and constructing latrines. Masons are recommended to only start selling latrines to communities after they are ODF as prior to that it has been found that they would distort and slow the natural CLTS processes and delay ODF attainment. During post-ODF review meetings, inform communities of the skills and services available. Support mason groups, monitor the quality of construction, and monitor progress alongside other post-ODF activities. (Carolyne Nabalema – The Phasing of CLTS and Sanitation Marketing in Uganda) Carol.Nabalema@plan-international.org http://www.communityledtotalsanitation.org/resource/phasing-clts-and-sanitation-marketing-uganda

Recommendation/idea: Sequencing - Ensure behaviour change and ODF is reached before selling latrines. Otherwise it can delay ODF attainment (assuming ODF definition is not 100% “improved”). Market development based on consumer and supply side research takes time and needs to begin in tandem with/or before CLTS triggering, but actual selling should begin only after collective behaviour change to be ODF.

2. Indonesia: ‘One-stop Shop for Sanitation Consumers in Indonesia’ – reduces costs for both supplier and consumer by having all materials available at one point.

Consumers tend to spend a lot of resources on sourcing supplies and services needed for sanitation improvement from a variety of suppliers. The “one-stop shop” model of service delivery brings it all together in one point, reducing costs for the consumers. In East Java this resulted in as much as 25-
30% cost reduction, and has helped develop sanitation entrepreneurs who take orders and customise solutions on-site for households, on condition that they provide the unskilled labor for digging holes etc. They also offer further discounts if a hamlet is able to aggregate at least 10 orders. (Nilanjana Mukherjee, WSP) email bubul44@gmail.com

Recommendation/idea: A ‘one-stop shop’ reduces costs for both supplier and consumer by having all materials and services available at one point.

3. **Indonesia: Spontaneous Developments in Markets sparked by TSSM (Total Sanitation & Sanitation Marketing Project, WSP) Interventions in Indonesia**

Sumadi – a trained mason in Nganjuk District – developed three differently priced and progressively upgradeable improved sanitation options using locally available materials. His one page ‘Informed Choice Catalogue’ explains the pros and cons and prices. Sumadi is now (2011) a sanitation entrepreneur with a network of over 30 masons in Nganjuk and adjoining districts. This model has since been replicated in several districts of East Java. *(Learning at Scale, TSSM Indonesia Update: WSP Field Note, June 2009)*


Recommendation/idea: Development of upgradeable models for progressive improvement, starting with models and costs that the poorest consumer can afford. Such information is not readily available to sanitation providers, but can be made available through market research

4. **Vietnam: Accreditation - Endorsing Service Providers Through Accreditation**

Village masons who had been trained through the International Development Enterprise project received formal ‘certified mason’ accreditation from the Ministry of Health, which helped to reassure customers of their credibility. *(Harnessing Market Power for Rural Sanitation: WSP Field Note, Feb. 2005)*

Recommendation/idea: Accreditation – certified trained masons by Health Ministry/equivalent authority trusted by consumers.

5. **Uganda: ODF Celebration – a Marketing Opportunity**

In the Ugandan CLTS/Sanmark approach, marketing is preferred to begin only after a community has become ODF and full behaviour change has been effected. Local masons are then invited to the ODF Celebration event of a community to market their wares and to demonstrate how household latrines can be improved. *(Carolyne Nabalema – The Phasing of CLTS and Sanitation Marketing in Uganda)*

Recommendation/idea: Use ODF celebration as a forum for masons to market latrines

6. **Uganda: Loans for Toilets**

Financial institutions such as village savings and loans associations (VSLAs) and Savings and Cooperative societies (SACCOs)’s loan portfolios include home improvement loans to households to improve their houses with better roof, floor, etc. Plan Uganda is experimenting with engaging
financial institutions to extent credit for latrine construction within the home improvement portfolio. (Carol Nabalema – Plan Uganda) email Carol.Nabalema@plan-international.org

Recommendation/idea: Base financing options on consumer behaviour research. Instalment payments or deferred payment until harvest time have been found to be more popular in Indonesia than loans for sanitation facilities. Loans for home improvement can be linked to include sanitation (eg in Uganda).

7. **India: Market research and product development**

In India the local plastic pour-flush pans developed by NAG & Co in Pune were developed over a period of 6-8 months of full engagement with ODF communities. The company realised that there was a need to redesign their pans in keeping with community preferences: steeper elevation to reduce water requirement for flushing; fibreglass coating on plastic pan in order to ease cleaning and to protect it from cigarette burns; U-tube converted to a small cup-sized pot to reduce water use. This type of research could not be done by facilitators. (Kamal Kar, CLTS Foundation) email kamalkar@yahoo.com

Recommendation/idea: Entrepreneurs who have technical skills and aptitudes in innovative designs have a vested interest in improving materials for a pro-poor market.

8. **Pakistan: Community Resource Persons (CRPs)**

Community Resource Persons are community activists (= natural leaders) who gain social mobilization capacity for CLTS through training from the master trainers. They often develop further into entrepreneurs or small and medium enterprises (SMEs) after assessing the gap between supply (of sanitation material and services) and demand (of building household latrines post CLTS/ SLTS triggering and hygiene promotion activities).

These activists will be given formal training on the development of business skills so that they become self-employed. They may get into the businesses such as selling pit lining material, latrines, slabs for use in latrine construction, pans, tiled concrete slabs with embedded ceramic pans etc. There may also be masons who have potential to assess the size of the market for latrines and be willing to self employ themselves to become local entrepreneurs. (Syed Shah Nasir Khisro, IRSP, Pakistan) email ssnkhisro@gmail.com

Recommendation/idea: Natural Leaders can become marketers but there is a need to carefully assess whether CLTS facilitators and marketers can be the same people or whether there are conflicts of interest. The roles appear contradictory but one may lead naturally into the other. People who function as both facilitators and marketers must understand that the two functions cannot be simultaneous, as selling interferes with the build up of momentum for collective behaviour change. Selling must come only after ODF.

9. **Nigeria: Artisan Fairs- facilitating local communities to construct their own latrines and move up the sanitation ladder in Nigeria**

Often when communities construct their basic latrines, they report one challenge or another with using them, such as a high water table (makes water splash on our buttocks when we defecate), or loose soil (the latrines can collapse within a couple of months). The Artisan Fair is based on the premise that the communities can and have the capacity to understand and find solutions to their
problems. With the right facilitation, the community is able to analyze to the point of finding the solution to the challenges.

During the Artisan Fair the issues as experienced are documented, and communities then deliberate on what can possibly be done to address the challenges. Ideas are presented as sketches drawn with markers on flip chart papers by the individual community members or groups proposing the solution. They are then peer-critiqued by the entire community. This is done constructively and amendments are made to the design where necessary. The afternoon session then focuses on practical demonstrations of how the proposed technology works. This actual construction involves others beyond the designer and is done in an environment of fun, drumming, music and dance if this is appropriate. This really creates the right mood and is a way of ensuring people remain engaged throughout the process.

In Ujol community (Utonken, Ado LGA, Benue State), the Artisan Fair resulted in two seasonal designs – one traditional pit for the dry season, and an offset pour-flush for the rainy season when the water table is high. (Ada Oko-Williams, WaterAid Nigeria) email AdaOko-Williams@wateraid.org

Recommendation/idea: Artisan Fairs can help to improve latrine designs through a creative communal process, as with the development of seasonal latrines. Business models can then be developed for delivering options.

10. Ethiopia: Revolving Funds in the Community Led Total Sanitation and Hygiene approach (CLTSH)

Sanitation Marketing following ODF is promoted through local artisans/local service providers selected from communities and given training. In order to respond to the demands of communities for improved sanplats, the Government and partners have experimented with giving seed money to communities through their associations to purchase materials needed to produce slabs that are not available locally including cement, reinforcement iron bars, etc. This is then used as a revolving fund within the association to enable all households to purchase their own materials. In two different regions of Ethiopia, Tigray and Southern Region (SNNPR), masons are developing popular latrine slabs chiselled out of the local stone. These are produced at about half the price of a cement slab. (Muchie Kidanu, UNICEF Ethiopia) email mkidanu@unicef.org

Recommendation/idea: Seed grants can be given to communities to produce and sell slabs, setting up a revolving fund to support all households willing to pay. Local market solutions may be found, as with stone slabs. For scaling up, it would be prudent to base such decisions on country/region-specific consumer research and supply chain assessment.

11. Kenya: Promoting micro entrepreneurs as professional sanitation service providers in rural Kenya

In Kenya, CLTS has been adopted as a national approach to sanitation promotion. By July 2011, more than 1,000 villages have been declared ODF, including 746 villages from the UNICEF supported and Ministry led national CLTS programme. While CLTS has created demand for sanitation solutions, especially in Western and Nyanza provinces, the supply of sanitation solutions has been inadequately addressed till now. SNV is taking lead on developing a market based approach to sanitation solutions. The concept builds on the private sector promotion model developed for operation and maintenance of rural water points in Kenya under the DFID-funded Market Assistance
Programme (to be launched in 2011). This involves i) market research, ii) strengthening technical and business development/management skills of local micro-entrepreneurs, and iii) facilitating forward (to communities) and backward (to supply chain actors at the regional/national level) linkages of these micro-entrepreneurs based on their business plans developed. The above programme further builds on the finding of the ongoing sanitation supply side study commissioned by International Finance Corporation and Water and Sanitation Programme of the World Bank. Several donors have been facilitating an approach called ‘Making Markets Work for the Poor (M4P)’ http://www.mmw4p.org/dyn/bds/docs/detail/474/6 with a primary focus on economic sectors. Such approaches can be useful in promoting sanitation solutions for the rural poor (Source: Chiranjibi Tiwari: ctiwari@snvworld.org)

Recommendation/idea: A strategic approach is needed to develop market for sanitation solutions in rural areas. While no subsidies should be handed out to households, research and pro-poor market development do need external funding.

12. Uganda: What next beyond ODF?

In Uganda, Plan ensures considerable presence within the communities that are ODF through hygiene and sanitation activities relating to water management, food and personal hygiene and a continued promotion of hand washing and latrine hygiene. Plans are to follow up these communities with review meetings at least every 6 months to go on up to 2 years after ODF. In areas like Tororo district where the supply side of the sanitation marketing component has been developed, this includes selling of latrines after ODF to enable households to move up the sanitation ladder. (Carol Nabalema – Plan Uganda) Carol.Nabalema@plan-international.org

Recommendation/idea: Undertake long-term planning for post-ODF

Recommendations
In summary, the group working on sanitation marketing recommends the following points for pro-poor marketing and scaling up beyond ODF:

- With CLTS, behaviour change has taken place – trust communities to maintain ODF and to upgrade their latrines as required
- Support this social norm change through communication campaigns and the availability of low-cost sanitation improvement options in the local market
- Undertake formative research and supply chain assessment to identify financially viable pro-poor sanitation marketing strategies (The 4Ps: products, price, place and promotion).
- Market research should be begun before demand creation through CLTS, to allow time for the 4Ps to be identified and market capacity developed.
- Sequence so that promotion and selling are not combined with CLTS triggering and post-triggering follow up, but begin only after the achievement of ODF status.
- Do not end facilitation with ODF but put in place a continuous follow-up mechanism to support sustained behaviour change and sanitation and hygiene improvements
- Recognise that scaling up is likely to require financing mechanisms for both providers and consumers.
Sources & follow-up contacts:

Jane Bevan, UNICEF WCARO  
Nilanjana Mukherjee, WSP  
Carol Nabalema, Plan Uganda  
Chiranjibi Tiwari, SNV Kenya

jbevan@unicef.org  
bubul44@gmail.com  
Carol.Nabalema@plan-international.org  
ctiwari@snvworld.org

Useful Resources:


WSP Online Sanitation Marketing toolkit:  http://www.wsp.org/wsp/toolkit/toolkit-home